

THE IMPLEMENTATION OF SMART CITY IN CREATING INNOVATIONS OF PUBLIC SERVICES BY REGIONAL GOVERNMENTS

(CASE STUDY OF BANDUNG CITY AND MAKASSAR CITY)

Widuri Wulandari¹ Siti Munawaroh²

Abstract

In order to make improvements in public services, the City Government of Bandung and Kota Makassar implement Smart City, and it is also in accordance with the directions of the Kementerian Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara & Reformasi Birokrasi provide quality services that satisfy the needs of society in the fields of education, health, housing, and so forth. Local governments must also work creatively and innovatively to improve accountability, transparency, and responsiveness by utilizing information technology. The focus of this study is to compare the Government of Bandung with Makassar City in running Smart City in order to implement the innovation of public services. As a method for this research, a qualitative analysis is used, so that the phenomena or situations in the field can be realistically and systematically explained in detail while using the review literature from previous research. The Governments of Bandung City and Makassar City have shown to be successful areas with the implementation of Smart City. Both cities have received many awards for providing innovative services of high quality in spite of the fact that Makassar city started relatively late with implementing Smart City. Although they have been successful so far, the innovation of public services in these two cities will still have to be improved, so that a larger part of society will be able to profit from them. It takes a deep commitment on the part of the local authorities in order to be able to implement Smart City that creates an innovative programme. Smart City's implementation is a solution for creating good governance and makes improvements across multiple sectors of society. Moreover, Smart City sustains community activities and also provides easy access to information made by local governments.

Keywords: *Smart City, Innovation, Public Service*

INTRODUCTION

The implementation of public services in Indonesia continues to change. Since the New Order era has collapsed and has been replaced by the period of reform, change has occurred in all areas such as economy, culture, politics, law, and bureaucracy. Changes to public service providers

then called bureaucratic reforms. With the reform of the bureaucracy is certainly one of the goals to improve the performance of the bureaucrats in order not to practice KKN, and increase public confidence in the government, especially the public service. Government organizers are no longer fully at the center, but in accordance with the laws and regulations, Indonesia implements regional autonomy. Where each region has the right to take care of its own household. So even in the case of the implementation of public services. Although the enactment of regional autonomy, not even the free area to do anything, must still follow the rules of the central government. As well as the Regulation of the Minister of Administrative Reform and Bureaucratic Reform No. 30 of 2014.

Through the regulation, every agency, both central and local government, is instructed to make an innovation in public service. The purpose of the regulation is to realize good governance and clean. Through this regulation, local governments are beginning to make changes in carrying out public services. Providing a good service and satisfying the community is the task of local government because the local government is closer to the community. However, sometimes local governments are considered incompetent in providing public services to the public so that many people who provide complaints related to services provided. The issue should encourage the government to undertake a service improvement.

Public service becomes a strategic issue because it tends to run on the spot, while the impact is very wide for political life, socio-cultural, economic, and so forth. Public service has been a variable that gave rise to a crisis of public confidence to local governments, as well as administrative services. This service tends to be long, convoluted because it is not integrated into one door. This causes the services provided are ineffective and inefficient.

But large areas such as Surabaya, Semarang, Bandung, Jakarta and Makassar, Yogyakarta are areas that can be said to have improved its public service, namely through the application of smart city. The regions are taking advantage of advances in information technology to create innovative public

services. Today, every government agency is required to be creative and innovative as described above. Kemen PAN-RB, annually gives awards to innovative central and local government agencies. And government agencies will be included in TOP 99 Public Service Innovation. Through the SINOVIK MENPAN website, then each region can register an innovative program or activity.

Implementation of the smart city in the implementation of public services as an effort in improving the quality of public services, oriented to the public interest, and open nature that is accessible to the general public. One area that is considered to have a lot of innovation in public services, and has run smart city that is Bandung City. The city of Bandung under the leadership of Ridwan Kamil has made many changes and created programs/activities that all have taken advantage of technological progress. Through programs/activities that run in the city of Bandung, so the Government of Bandung get an A for accountability of the Ministry of PAN-RB. Some awards have been obtained by the Government of Bandung as a city that has given birth to innovations in the administration and public service. One of the awards is obtained from Yakkato magazine as a technology-based government implemented by Bandung City Government since 2013.

And other areas that have implemented smart city, which gave birth to innovation in the public service of Makassar City. But the city of Makassar is a city that has just implemented smart city, compared with the city of Bandung. In 2017, Makassar City was named one of the winning cities of Smart City Award 2017 by the Ministry of Communications and Informatics (Kemkominfo).

Both city governments both Bandung and Makassar have implemented smart city in the implementation of public services, resulting in several innovations. As well as each of the city government has earned several awards. But surely these two city governments have different programs/activities, tailored to the local conditions and needs of the

community. So for that, the authors are interested to know how the application of smart city by creating innovations in public services in both city government of Bandung and Makassar.

RESEARCH METHODS

The method of this research is to analyze qualitatively, so that it can explain the phenomenon or situation in the field in real, systematic and detailed, using the review literature. The literature review is the way used to collect data or sources related to the topic raised in a study. The literature of this review is obtained from various sources such as books, journals, internet, news, etc.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Getting good public service and quality is the right of society, as well as a liability for the public service delivery that makes it happen. Legal Rules of Law Number 25 of the Year 2009 as the reference of public service providers to carry out their duties. But if we look at the field, as well as one of the examples that I described above, that there are still areas that in carrying out public services not in accordance with what is expected. Like the initial goal of bureaucratic reform, that is change. At least this change towards a more innovative and creative. Inoasi public service is an acceleration in improving the quality of service in accordance with the expectations of the community. Not only to make changes but also to make updates, to create ideas, new ideas capable of resolving community problems quickly, accurately, responsively and accurately, and able to create a valuable public service to international competitiveness.

Through KemenPAN-RB, the government "insists" that every government institution innovates in the public service. This public service innovation is also expected to be a bureaucratic culture. The government through KemenPAN-RB then implemented the policy of "one agency, one

innovation", where every government institution either Ministries / Institutions up to local government. KemenPAN-RB then made an innovation competition in public service that began in 2014 until now. Each year will be awarded to both central and local government agencies to the areas included in the TOP of public service innovation.

Smart City as Public Service Innovation in Bandung City

As explained in the introduction that there are some local governments that have implemented smart city governance. And the areas that become 'smart city' are big cities in Indonesia. One of them as has been done by Bandung City Government. Through the Mayor of Bandung, Ridwan Kamil has a vision that is to become the city of Bandung as a smart city that creates a culture of innovation and technology. Where through the leadership of Ridwan Kamil, emerging innovative public services. Some of the goals of Bandung City Government apply smart city that is in creating a quality public service, improving the performance of State Civil Apparatus (ASN), facilitate interaction with citizens and transparency in data (open data).

In the public service itself, there is a form of innovation done in terms of population, licensing, complaints, taxation, industry & business, as well as publications and information. All of these services are technology-based and online. So the people of Bandung can access the service anytime and anywhere. No need to come and meet the bureaucrats again. Through innovative public services, the city of Bandung achieved 3 TOP 99 innovations in the national public service in 2016. The public service of Bandung City Government entering TOP is "from zero to zero", namely to build a generation of healthy love in schools that are ready to build the country, and "OMBA is motorcycle taxi toddler, malnutrition handling through omba and cooking center at UPT Health Center Riung Bandung (Miftah, 2016).

Figure 1

Changes After Smart City Implementation



The innovation of excellent public service created by the City Government of Bandung as a city of a smart city is as follows:

a) From Zero to Hero

This program is one of the TOP 35 Public Service Innovations Year 2016. This program is a collaboration between the government and the public to create a clean toilet. This innovation relates to thousands of schools in Bandung that are targeted to realize a healthy school, making schools have toilets like a three-star class hotel (Miftah, 2016).

b) Omaba (*Ojek Makanan Balita*)

This program is also included in the TOP 99 Public Service Innovation Year 2016. With this innovation, Bandung City Government has succeeded in reducing the mortality rate of infants from malnutrition to being healthy. Omaba program is delivering daily service delivery of healthy food that is managed by the community from urban farming farms so that products are healthy and well maintained.

c) The Jasmine Credit Program (Against Moneylenders)

In order to help the citizens of Bandung get business capital, the Government of Bandung City through Local Bank Perkreditan Rakyat (PD BPR) launched a program of Credit Jasmine or Credit Against Moneylenders. This program gives light loans to residents of Bandung City to fight loan sharks. This program has been inaugurated by the Mayor of Bandung, Ridwan Kamil. Programs one of Bandung City Government efforts to reduce poverty in the city of Bandung, and help develop the business and encourage new entrepreneurs. This program is also preferred for the perpetrators of SMEs in Bandung. And there is also Credit program Mesra (Masjid Sejahtera).

d) Bandung Command Center

Bandung Command Center an innovative idea from Bandung Mayor Ridwan Kamil as one of the efforts to make the city of Bandung as a leading and smart city where one of its efforts is the use of information and communication technology. Public service provided by Bandung Command Center to the community more complete with the application of X-IGENT Panic Button. For public services, there are three excellent facilities owned by Bandung Command Center that is REPORT! (Application Services and Online People), NTPD 112 and Android-based applications Panic Button.

This application becomes a centralized and integrated security solution, where people are in an emergency condition. X-Igent Panic Button is a panic button app that can send emergency information to your closest relatives quickly and precisely. The function of the Command Center has two main functions, namely to improve the public service to the outside and to facilitate the inward service in terms of decision-making management (decision support system). For public services, there are three excellent facilities owned by Bandung Command Center that is REPORT! (Application Services and Online People), NTPD 112 and Android-based applications Panic Button.

e) Layad Rawat Program

The program was officially launched by Ridwan Kamil in July 2017. This program was inspired by the many cases of unavailable patients due to limited room facilities in hospitals. Through this program, there are 1598 health workers of which there are 87 doctors, 184 midwives, and 23 nutritionists, who will be deployed to the community to care for the sick. As the name implies, Layad Rawat, the medical team will come to the house of patients who need a pillow. To call the medical team, residents just call to 119 (toll-free). And later there will be officers who connect patients to the nearest clinic for immediate follow-up by the officers (Miftah, 2017).

f) Program Lover Champion

Vehicle Counseling Program Silih Asih Champion (Lover Champion) was inaugurated by Ridwan Kamil in September 2017. This program was initiated by Bandung City Government through Bandung Health Office as a result of collaboration with government institutions and community communities, especially in the field of physical and mental health. The purpose of this Winner Lover program is to improve the happiness index of Bandung community by suppressing the influence of negative emotions through various counseling.

And there are many more programs/activities in Bandung City Government during the leadership of Ridwan Kamil to smart city. Such as e-PunTen, Bus WisataBandros, Garbage Picking Movement, Katresna Sadaya, online media sabilulungan, Kampung Tolerance programming and many others. The programs/activities that exist in Bandung City Government are partly innovations that have just been created or really new (discontinues innovation), and there is also a new change to the condition or product service (subtaining innovation). So far, several public service innovation services that have been implemented in Pemkot Bandung, get special attention from the community. People continue to participate in participant to advance the city of Bandung together. It appears that from some

innovative programs/activities there are some that depart from the idea of society.

From some form of public service innovation that exist in Pemkot Bandung, one of which will be explained more deeply related to its implementation is Layad Rawat program. Judging from the communication made in this activity is information provided service providers ie Health Office Bandung and Puskesmas to the community. This program has been informed by the people of Bandung through social media Ridwan Kamil itself such as facebook, twitter, and Instagram. So also through the official website of Bandung City Government and Bandung City Health Office. Through these social media, Bandung City Government explained how to get Layad Rawat's health service. People can contact 119 for 24 hours, without having to come to the hospital or health center. Health Department has also conducted socialization per community and for the region have been exposed to the lower layers of society undertaken by puskesmas.

When viewed from the resources in the Layad Rawat program is divided by the area of UPT Puskesmas in TIAP District there is the total of 80 Puskesmas, doctors are allocated there are 87 doctors, 184 nurses and 187 SKM (Bachelor of Public Health) and 23 nutrition workers. If the community contacts, there will be a team consisting of 1 doctor, 1 nurse or midwife, and 1 nutrition worker when required with a 30-minute arrival set. For the condition to be prepared by the community, namely BPJS and SKTM when Layad Rawat team arrived, and the community is not charged (Miftah, 2017). However, according to the Chief Medical Officer of Bandung, medical personnel for Layad Rawat program is still considered less. Ideally to serve more than two million citizens of Bandung City and 325 thousand categorized as poor, 1,110 medical officers consisting of 200 doctors, 400 nurses, 300 midwives and 70 nutritionists (Nungroho, 2017) are required.

If talking about the attitude of executors, then the high commitment of Ridwan Kamil to provide quality services to the people of Bandung, especially to people who can not afford. Similarly, the Health Office of

Bandung City trying to pick up the ball from the public. Ridwan Kamil, a country that comes to citizens, not citizens who come to the country.

There are two criteria for patients who can get Layad Rawat service. First, the community that has been recorded by the puskesmas in the Public Health Care (Perkesmas) program that has been recorded in the area and second is the emergency case. Like the poor who are really poor and need immediate help or he is difficult to reach health services (Nungraha, 2017).

The Laya Rawat program has also received an award from the Indonesia Health Care Forum (IHCF) for Integrated Emergency Management System (SPGDT) at the IHCF Innovation Award 2018 in Jakarta. This health service innovation makes it easier for people to receive services. Layad Rawat program itself has served thousands of patients with different symptoms, which is about 2,900 patients in the city of Bandung. People of Bandung City can more quickly know the disease, and immediately get the right medicine (Trishandiani, 2018). Officers can come anytime to the community.

Thanks to the innovation held by Ridwan Kamil, Bandung get A border in 2016 in the implementation of bureaucratic reform. KemenPAN-RB conducts bureaucratic evaluation annually. Evaluation results in 2016, there are two who received the predicate BB, namely the Provincial Government of Yogyakarta (DIY) and Central Java Provincial Government. While that reaches B there are 11 provinces, 14 regions got CC, and there are still seven predicated C. As for the district/city, no one has achieved the value of BB. Noted there are 22 districts/cities that get the predicate B, 22 districts/cities got CC, and there is still 15 whose value C (<http://keuda.kemendagri.go.id>).

Smart City as Public Service Innovation in Makassar City

Makassar City is the capital of South Sulawesi Province and as the capital which is the gateway of eastern Indonesia and also as a trade, social, political, economic route. However, the increasing number of people from year to year and the limited natural resources make the management of the city become increasingly complex. This condition then demands the local government to be able to maximize the potential of its resources and minimize the constraints or problems encountered. To be able to realize a developed city, the city of Makassar apply Smart City. The concept of Smart City is a major issue in big cities around the world, and this encourages an active role as well as community participation in city management using the Citizen Centric approach, thus there is a more dynamic and close interaction between citizens and service providers, in this case, Local government.

Smart City is the management and development of the city by utilizing technology and communication to connect, monitor and control the resources in the city more effectively and efficiently in order to maximize service to the community and support sustainable development (Amri, 2016). In the intelligent government consists of aspects of political participation and service for the community as an administrative function. It is also supported by participation in decision making, public service, and social, transparent governance and political strategies and perspectives (Giffinger, 2007).

Smart City program is a solutive program to make Makassar twice as good as Smart and Sombere concept. In this case, Smart City deals with technology while Sombere is a Makassar culture and will create a city with strong character. Sombere and Smart City include 6 dimensions of smart governance, smart branding, smart living, smart society, smart economy, and smart environment. Smart governance is to optimize public services from the city government. Smart branding is to increase awareness of the character of the city, especially for tourism. Smart economy is associated

with a good ecosystem and encourages less cash society. Smart living is creating a comfortable life and increasing awareness of health. Smart society is to build an interactive society and humanist. The smart environment is to reduce and utilize waste and create a better energy source (Mufarida, 2018).

With the Smart City Program will be an "IT enabler" to drive cultural change, transforming HR to respond more quickly to technology. Support from infrastructure such as optics, Free Wi-fi access, and 3G, 4G to support broadband network continues to be built, making Makassar one of the cities that receive appreciation and appreciation from various circles (Kominfo Makassar, 2017).

Smart City applied by the City of Makassar has several excellent programs, such as:

a) War Room

Complementing the concept of Makassar Sombere and Smart City, Makassar Mayor built War Room which is the operational space of Pemkot Makassar to combat the problems in society. War Room (Commons Room) which connects the CCTV camera owned by Makassar City Government scattered at various points on the monitor screen. The War Room was built in August 2015 and starts operation in December 2015. The city government can monitor city activities through 115 CCTV spread over the strategic locations of the room. CCTV has not been added to the telecommunications provider as many as 23 units and 73 points on the highway. Of 115 CCTV owned by City Government, only 12 units in the form of fixed camera, the rest can be rotated and zoomed up to 32 times the actual size. One of the concerns of the municipal government is Karebosi Field which is often a subscription event in Makassar city. There are 15 operators that manage data from the public and 24 call center operators who are in charge of receiving complaints from the public through the number 112. The function of the call center is more in emergency situations, such as disaster, crime, and health problems. With a call center in case of a health emergency, people no longer have 48 health center numbers in

Makassar but only 112. Not only that, after the War Room the crime rate in Makassar City such as the convention decreased dramatically, and this certainly makes people calmer while traveling, especially at night (Kalsum, 2016).

b) Drone and CCTV Based Security Monitoring

To maintain commonalities within the community, the City Government of Makassar conducts CCTV installation in public places and also strategic places in Makassar City is equipped with the obligation of every commercial building to install CCTV outside and into the site of the building, and also coupled with the installation of Infra Red camera that is technologically high and reinforced by the Drone Guard system and the War Room operating and monitoring center which is able to control and provide factual, visual, and accurate event information throughout the city for 24 hours. This is an effort in building the system "Somber and Smart Public Security" Makassar City to create a sense of security and security in the business community in Makassar. Not only that, the City Government of Makassar also has a CCTV camera installed 69 pieces, but for the future with the target of planning 3000 CCTV units to monitor every street (Hajiali, 2017). Each building has CCTV integrated with the city, and IP-based data system equipped with micro thermal sensors and malicious objects. An infrared camera that can detect whether someone is carrying dangerous objects such as firearms or sharp weapons. Thus a crime can be prevented before it occurs.

c) *Smart Card*

Smart City socialization has been successful because it is included as a function in the form of services for the community. One such as Smart Card. In Smart Card there are everything like ATM, Debit Card, to Medical Record (Wahyudiyanta, 2016). Smart Card as a means of payment and also as data access to Makassar government system. Smart Card takes data from the community by working with Bank BRI, and the community is not charged, while BRI Bank get clients. If seen basically the card is the same function with a debit card that is to withdraw cash from an ATM machine,

while the difference Smart Card also keep personal data listed on electronic ID card. For its use it only needs to be affixed to Android-based smartphones with special applications, all data in e-ID, BPJS, NPWP, and UN will appear on the screen of the mobile phone. Cards with models like this are the only ones in the world.

Not only that, this Smart Card can also record the cardholder's spending usage, and will be notified properly mobile banking, ie time, place, and amount of expenditure. What is more interesting than the Smart Card is in the card there is also a report or history of disease owned by the cardholder. The number of diseases that can be accommodated in the card is 125 types of diseases. Thus, when the cardholder suffers from an illness and wishes to seek treatment, the officer only needs to attach the card as an initial diagnosis. According to the Mayor who occurred in Indonesia is no longer the first aid in an accident, but an accident in first aid, due to complicated administration process when going to treatment. For that, this card becomes a very appropriate solution (Ramadhiani, 2015).

In detail smart cards have 2 functions namely as Debit and Brizzi Card. Debit Card (ATM) as an electronic payment, mobile BRI, and internet banking BRI Debit Card can be used for cash or non-cash transactions at 20.00 ATM BRI. While Brizzi is electronic money (prepaid card) replacement of cash that can be used for various payment transactions, such as payment in mini market, subsidized fuel distribution, toll gate, train ticket, and with merchant-merchant in cooperation with BRI. Meanwhile, data access to the government system of Makassar City, Smart Card can access data from the government system of Makassar City which is based on cloud computing where NIK which function access key in injecting in clip Brizzi. The first relates to employee data sourced from the Makassar City Administration's personnel body which contains detailed personal history including the management of attendance and reporting. Second, population data sourced from the database of the Ministry of Home Affairs, which functions as E-ID card, medical record data, taxation, membership data of BPJS and other data connected to NIK contained in Smart Card (Effendy, 2018).

Convenience is the thing to offer BRI and Makassar City Government, therefore access to government data can be accessed by web bases using a computer or laptop connected to the internet, and using android that has installed Smart Card application in it.

d) Home Care

Makassar Home Care is a health service that targets home residents. If you need home health services, you only need to call 112 in the City Government War Room (Hajiali, 2017). Furthermore, the call center will contact the nearest health clinic to immediately send the team "Dottoro'ta" (our doctor) to the resident's home. The team consists of three people, namely doctors, nurses and a driver of smart vehicles equipped with ultrasonography and EKG (electrocardiogram). Our doctor's car also has diagnostic tools. Dottoro'ta has 48 vehicles spread over 48 health centers. Last data, Home Care successfully handled 4,205 residents, 60% were handled at home, and 40% were referred to puskesmas (Kalsum, 2016).

As for the vehicle instead of using the ambulance car most of the big, but this ambulance using Suzuki Karimun Wagon R that has been modified. The use of this LCGC car allows entry into narrow alleys. Indeed, the task of this ambulance is to provide treatment to home residents or patients to take the take-out to health centers or hospitals. In addition, the officer also does not remain silent, the patient's health condition is reported to the physician concerned so that the doctor can be prepared to take the necessary action when the patient arrives. With this service, the number of patients in hospitals in Makassar decreased by 80%. The hospital is full of patients from areas outside Makassar (Wahyudiyanta, 2016).

e) Smart Pete-Pete

Smart Pete-Pete is the most sophisticated city transportation in Indonesia. This tool replaces the conventional Pete-Pete, and is designed by the Mayor of Makassar and is a prototype of an environmentally friendly public vehicle with a high enough system of equity. This transportation is

equipped with CCTV surveillance on the inside, front and rear. Not only that, the various features of the facility is also prepared to pamper passengers who boarded the Smart Pete-Pete ranging from Stop Contact (place plugs) in every seat, Wi-fi, air conditioning, LCD television, and solar cell panel facilities.

In addition, the car body is designed with a wall dominated transparent glass to avoid the occurrence of acts of sexual harassment and other crimes against passengers, because of all activity in the car seen from the outside. Compared to Pete-Pete the vehicle's conventional capability is also much larger that is 16 people. With the number of seats 12 and prepared for passengers stands as many as four people. This transportation as a solution from Makassar municipal government to overcome the congestion, and has run well, so only need improvement by still accommodate the old Pete-Pete driver as the person who will continue the operation of this Smart Pete-Pete in the future (Hajiali, 2017).

After the explanation regarding smart city flagship program in Makassar City, hereinafter will be discussed related to the implementation of one of the excellent program that is Home Care service. Home Care is a continuous and comprehensive healthcare service provided to individuals and families in their place of residence aimed at improving, maintaining or maximizing the degree of independence and minimizing the consequences of disease (Azikin, 2017). Home Care services have legal basis one of Makassar Mayor Regulation No. 6 of 2016 on Home Care Service 24 Hours (Home Care) in Makassar. With the regulation is a commitment from the government of Makassar to provide the best health services for the community.

Home Care has program outputs such as the fulfillment of health services that reach all levels of society quickly by increasing the independence of patients and families in doing health care and financing cheaper. The number of patients handled increased sharply over time. The number of patients handled by the Home Care Program since its launch in

December 2015 to the end of the Year 2015 is 2,266, and by 2016 by 4,685 (Azikin, 2017). The number of patients who can be handled by home care services, based on the latest data 80% of patients in the hospital has decreased, and patients come from outside the city of Makassar. To support the program's effectiveness, Makassar City Government has added a Home Care fleet named Dottoro'ta Car (Doker Kita). Until now the number of Home Care fleet amounted to 48 vehicles.

After the implementation of Home Care to make health services in Makassar more perfect, holistic, and comprehensive. This makes the patient's needs have been met so that patients have been more comfortable and satisfied with professional nursing care. Approach home care program with direct nursing make this program run effectively compared to health services ever. Direct nursing includes the bio, psycho, socio, spiritual assessment with a direct physical examination, observation and direct interview. This method then makes the service more detailed. Home care programs provide an answer if the health needs of the community is a very important and often very important need for them in the midst of the many problems of society. The presence of home care in the midst of the Makassar community has been able to solve one basic problem that has been their burden, fast, appropriate and reaching all levels of society (Azikin, 2017).

Home care services can run smoothly due to support from human resources, facilities and infrastructure, and strong commitment from various stakeholders. At the beginning of the service, the community still did not respond and the level of trust was still very low, therefore the Health Office of Makassar City continued to socialize to the most remote areas. This socialization took the local community leaders (Putra, et al., 2017). With the continuous socialization of public trust is growing and use home care services when there are family members who are sick. Ease of access to these services is also an important factor in supporting the success of home care. Communities only need to contact the nearest puskesmas telephone number or contact call center 112 to get home care service.

In general, the implementation of home care in Makassar, which runs since December 2015 and implemented by 48 health centers in all areas of Makassar City until now has been running well. This is evidenced by home care users who reach 4685 people. This large number of users cannot be separated from the advantages of home care innovation, and also no service charge. The advantages of home care are the existence of 3 forms of health services, ie home care visited, home care followed up, and home care emergency. This service also takes 24 hours, in accordance with Makassar Mayor's Regulation no 6 2016, so if there is a sick society at night can still get help because of the medical side standby for 24 hours (Putra, et al., 2017).

Thanks to this innovative service the Government of Makassar was awarded the Top 35 public service innovation in 2016, and the award was handed over by Vice President Jusuf Kalla, accompanied by Menpan RB Yuddy Chrisnandy to Makassar Mayor (Abdurrahman, 2017). Not only that, Makassar City is one of the seventy-one cities in Indonesia that received the Smart City Nusantara Implementation Award from PT Telekomunikasi Indonesia Tbk. The city of Makassar is considered to be eligible for an award because Smart City's developed infrastructure is among the best in Indonesia, as well as the accessibility of content in the smart city (Hidayat, 2016).

The awards are given to motivate other cities to always develop Smart City in their area, thus the community can also benefit. The Mayor of Makassar believes that the development of Smart City in Makassar combines information technology with the local wisdom of Makassar, "Smart City and Somber". This is useful for a touch of heart or touching heart for Smart City can be accepted by the public. The most important point is that Smart City is not only about the ability to buy advanced technology tools, but how a city can change the way of thinking and also how to serve the community, and the city of Makassar can provide the best service for the community.

CONCLUSION

The Government of Bandung and the Government of Makassar City have been equally implementing smart city in the administration. By implementing smart city, these two municipal governments have spawned, created and developed more innovative and quality public services in line with the times, and the needs of the community. Bandung City Government first applies smart city than the Government of Makassar. Thus, some programs/activities Bandung City Government has been adopted by other areas.

The Government of Bandung has received many awards from the innovation that they apply. No exception, Bandung City Government then, get an A for accountability of Kemen PAN-RB. So also Pemkot Makassar, which has made many innovations in public service, so it has been awarded many. Both local governments can be considered successful in applying smart city because it has spawned several public service innovations that also take advantage of technological progress.

The very dominant role of smart city implementation is the high commitment of the regional heads. Although in the implementation there are still some shortcomings such as lack of human resources, facilities and infrastructure are less adequate and more. However, compared to other regions in Indonesia, Bandung and Makassar City Government are one step ahead in providing services to the community. And the enthusiasm of society is high enough to program/activity made by both of this city government, like Layad Rawat in Bandung City and Home Care in Makassar City.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Amri. (2016). Analisis Pemanfaatan Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi dalam Menunjang Terwujudnya Makassar sebagai “Smart City”. *Jurnal Komunikasi KAREBA*. Vol 5, No.2.
- Aneta, A. (2010). Implementasi Kebijakan Program Penanggulangan Kemiskinan Perkotaan (P2KP) di Kota Gorontalo. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 1(1), 54-65.
- Arif, S., dkk. (2010). *Paradigma Pelayanan Publik*. In A. A. Rohman, & M.M. Sa'id, *Reformasi Pelayanan Publik* (pp. 1-34). Malang: Averroes Press.
- Edwards III, G. (1980). *Implementing Public Policy*. Washington: Congressional Quarterly Press.
- Effendy. (2018). Makassar Smart Card Sangat Bermamfaat Positif Untuk Pegawai Pemkot Dan Warga. <http://m.beritakotaonline.com/14391/makassar-smart-card-sangat-bermamfaat-positif-untuk-pegawai-pemkot-dan-warga/>. Diakses pada 17 Mei 2018 pukul 12.35 WIB.
- Grindle, M. S. (1980). *Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Hajiali, Ismail. (2017). *Peran Smart City dalam Menunjang Pelayanan Publik di Kota Makassar*. Makassar. Diskominfo Kota Makassar.
- Hidayat, Dean. (2016). *Wali Kota Danny Terima Penghargaan Implementasi Smart City Nusantara*. <http://makassarkota.go.id/berita-1476-wali-kota-danny-terima-penghargaan-implementasi-smart-city-nusantara.html>. Diakses pada 17 Mei 2018 pukul 13.22 WIB.
- Info Bandung. (2015). Ini Cara Mengajukan Kredit Melati, Kredit Tanpa Bunga Program Pemkot Bandung. <http://infobandung.co.id/ini-cara-mengajukan-kredit-melati-kredit-tanpa-bunga-program-pemkot-bandung/>
- Kalsum, Umi. (2106). *Mencermati Konsep Smart City Kota Makassar*. <https://www.viva.co.id/berita/nasional/861664-mencermati-konsep-smart-city-kota-makassar>. Diakses pada 17 Mei 2018 pukul 12.12 WIB.
- Kominfo, Makassar. (2017). Analisis Strategis Smart City Kota Makassar Menuju Sombere dan Smart City. Makassar. Tim Teknis Smart City Makassar.
- Miftah. (2016). Presentasi Inovasi Pelayanan Publik. <https://portal.bandung.go.id/posts/2016/03/10/4O3Z/presentasi-inovasi-pelayanan-publik>

- Miftah. (2017). Pemkot Bandung resmi Luncurkan Program Program Layad Rawat.
<https://portal.bandung.go.id/posts/2017/07/27/LmVq/pemkot-bandung-resmi-luncurkan-program-layad-rawat>
- Miftah. (2017). Layad Rawat, Pelayanan Kesehatan di Rumah Warga.
<https://portal.bandung.go.id/posts/2017/07/20/rb2m/layad-rawat-pelayanan-kesehatan-di-rumah-warga>
- Mirnasari, R. M. (2013). Inovasi Pelayanan Publik UPTD Terminal Purabaya - Bungurasih. *Jurnal Kebijakan dan Manajemen Publik, Vol.1, Nomor 1*, 71-84.
- Mthethwa, R. M. (2012). Critical Dimensions for Policy Implementation. *African Journal of Public Affairs*, 5(2), 36-47.
- Monier, H. (1999). *Manajemen Pelayanan Umum*. Jakarta: Bina Aksara.
- Mufarida, Binti. (2018). Konsep Sombere dan Smart City Mampu Bawa Makassar ke Global Trend.
<https://makassar.sindonews.com/read/7635/1/konsep-sombere-dan-smart-city-mampu-bawa-makassar-ke-global-trend-1522937089>.
Diakses pada 17 Mei 2018 pukul 13.05 WIB.
- Nugroho, R. (2004). *Kebijakan Publik Formulasi, Implementasi, dan Evaluasi*. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo.
- Nugroho, R. (2012). *Public Policy*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia.
- Nugraha, Adi. (2017). Layad Rawat, Layanan Kesehatan Jemput Bola ala Bandung. <https://www.liputan6.com/regional/read/3012328/layad-rawat-layanan-kesehatan-jemput-bola-ala-bandung>
- Nurmandi, Achmad. (2010). Proses Manajemen Pengetahuan Bagi Inovasi Pelayanan Perizinan di Kota Yogyakarta. *Jurnal Studi Pemerintahan. 1 (1)*. 1-28.
- Putra, Arjuna., dkk. (2017). Inovasi Pelayanan Publik Bidang Kesehatan Berbasis Home Care di Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik. Vo.3. No.3*. 1-16.
- Ramadhiani, Arimbi. (2015). Menuju Kota Cerdas, Makassar Punya “Smart Card dan Home Care”.[Kompas.com.https://properti.kompas.com/read/2015/06/11/121340421/Menuju.Kota.Cerdas.Makassar.Punya.Smart.Card.dan.Home.Care](https://properti.kompas.com/read/2015/06/11/121340421/Menuju.Kota.Cerdas.Makassar.Punya.Smart.Card.dan.Home.Care). Diakses pada 17 Mei 2018 pukul 12.43 WIB.
- Ramdani Ridha Alwan. (2016). Inovasi Sosial cara Ridwan Kamil Siasato APBD yang Minim. <http://bandungkita.net/2016/03/inovasi-sosial-cara-ridwan-kamil-siasati-apbd-yang-minim/>

- Ratminto, & Winarsih, A.S. (2016). *Manajemen Pelayanan: Pengembangan Model Konseptual, Penerapan Citizen's Charter dan Standar Pelayanan Minimal*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Ristian, Andre. (2014). Kualitas Pelayanan Publik pada Komunitas Adat: Studi Kasus Komunitas Orang Lom di Kabupaten Bangka Tahun 2012-2013. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan dan Kebijakan Publik*. 1 (2). 257-291.
- Sampara, L., & Sugianto. (2000). *Pengembangan Pelaksanaan Pelayanan Prima*. Jakarta: LAN RI.
- Samsudin. (2014). Kinerja Pelayanan Publik Studi Kasus Pada Dinas Kependudukan dan Catatan Sipil (Disdukcapil) Kota Jambi. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan dan Kebijakan Publik, Vol.1 No.1*, 136-164.
- Sulistiyastuti, E. A. (2012). *Implementasi Kebijakan Publik (Konsep dan Aplikasinya di Indonesia)*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media .
- Syam, Fahrizal. (2017). Kota Makassar Raih Penghargaan Smart City Award 2017. <http://www.tribunnews.com/regional/2017/11/16/kota-makassar-raih-penghargaan-smart-city-award-2017>
- Trishandiani, Hesy. (2018). Layad Rawat Sabet Penghargaan IHFC Innovation Award 2018. <https://news.okezone.com/read/2018/05/03/1/1894249/setahun-digulirkan-program-layad-rawat-sabet-penghargaan-ihfc-innovation-award-2018>
- Wahyudiyanta. (2016). Begini cara Wali Kota Makassar Mengaplikasikan Smart City. detikNews. <https://news.detik.com/berita/d-3258628/begini-cara-wali-kota-makassar-mengaplikasikan-smart-city>. Diakses pada 17 Mei 2018 pukul 14.13 WIB.